To: Department Chairpersons

From: Esdras Tulier

Re: Department P&B Committee Minutes

Date: September 22, 2010

The purpose of this communication is to convey the requirements for Department P&B committee minutes as set forth in CUNY policies.

In accordance with sections 8.12 and 9.2 of the Bylaws of the CUNY Board of Trustees, the minutes of P&B committee proceedings shall conform, insofar as practicable, to Robert's Rules of Order. The Board Resolution of June 5, 1967 concerning P&B procedures (known as the "Max-Kahn Memorandum") provides in relevant part:

Minutes. The minutes of a P&B Committee should conform to the canons set forth by Robert's Rules of Order, Revised: (page 248) "The secretary should keep a record of what was done and not what was said..." The actions upon motions, and not the discussion which led to such actions, should be recorded, unless the P&B should order, by a majority vote, that the discussion be recorded. It is the duty of the Chairman of the P&B Committee to rule out of order random and irrelevant discussions of the candidate's merits, and to keep the discussions to the consideration of objective and relevant data, insofar as this is practicable. Voting should be by secret ballot. The minutes should be submitted for approval at the next succeeding meeting.

The body of the minutes should indicate the action on each candidate and the number of those voting on each side and those voting to abstain. For example:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Yes</th>
<th>No</th>
<th>Abstain</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The minutes should not indicate the substance of the discussion of the candidate's merits. For the purposes of determining if a quorum is present, the minutes should indicate the names of all committee members present for each vote. This may be done by indicating those present at the beginning of the meeting and their arrivals and departures as they occur.
In addition to reporting the action(s) taken, as discussed above, the minutes should generally contain the following:

a) the name of the committee;
b) the date, time, and place of the meeting;
c) the names of those present at the meeting in the following categories: voting members and non-voting members;
d) the fact that the regular chairperson and secretary were present or, in their absence, the names of the persons who substituted for them;
e) whether the minutes of the previous meeting were read and approved (as read, or as corrected), together with the date of the previous meeting; and the minutes should be signed by the secretary of the committee (who shall be a member of the committee), and may also be signed by the chairperson of the committee.

I urge you to stress to the P&B that CUNY policy requires that discussions of candidates during these meetings be kept confidential. (The minutes themselves are also confidential.) Finally, departmental P&B actions are communicated in writing to the candidate by the chairperson without any reason being given for a negative recommendation.

Please contact me if you have any questions concerning this or any related matter.

Cc: President Ricardo R. Fernández
    Provost Mary A. Papazian
    Dean Timothy Alborn
    Dean Deborah Eldridge
    Dean Edward Jarroll
    Dean Marzie Jafari
    Ms. Lourdes Perez
    Ms. Maryann Gerbacia
    Ms. Erica Matthews
    Dr. Jane Mottus